



7/12/2024

Todd Davlin
CITY OF PORTLAND MI

RE: Grant St. Substation – Construction Bid Evaluation

Dear Mr. Davlin:

Theka Associates has reviewed the bid proposals submitted by (3) electrical contractors for construction of the Grant St. Substation Project. We have carefully evaluated the proposals and have arrived at a recommendation for the overall best evaluated bid.

The following lump sum bids were received for construction of Grant St. Substation per a bid RFP which included project drawings, project specifications, and contract documents.

- Newkirk Electric - \$1,838,958
- Kent Power - \$2,293,828
- Asplundh - \$2,648,500

Newkirk only took a few minor exceptions to schedule and contract terms, nothing that Theka believes to be an item of concern or contention.

Newkirk has an excellent history and reputation of constructing quality substations for IOU and municipal utilities in Michigan and Ohio. Newkirk also has a history of performing substation and generation work for the City of Portland.

Theka finds no reason to believe that Newkirk Electric cannot build a high-quality substation in the proposed project timeline. Theka recommends that Portland Board of Light and Power select the low bidder Newkirk Electric to construct Grant St. Substation.

Please let me know if you have any questions or require any further information.

Revision 9/19/2024

Newkirk Electric submitted a revised price on 9/19/2024 with the following adjustments:

- Removal of the distribution vault.
- Removal of the transfer bus structures including associated bus, switches, and foundations.
- Added (6) steel riser structures for the distribution cable.
- Added slab foundations for the distribution cable termination cabinets.
- Added labor to install customer supplied distribution termination cabinets.
- Replaced (24) 6" fiberglass conduit bends with (48) 6" rigid galvanized steel conduit bends.
- Added conduit runs between termination cabinets.

The revised price submitted by Newkirk is \$1,646,929.00, a difference of -\$192,029.00. Theka's professional opinion is that this appears to be a fair adjustment given the scope adjustment. This is in fact larger than the \$150,000 savings Theka originally anticipated. City of Portland will have to procure (6) distribution junction boxes outside of this contract at a budget of approximately \$40,000.00. Therefore, the net project savings will be approximately \$152,000.00.

The proposed revisions should not have a major impact on the functional capabilities of the substation. The (6) junction boxes will replace the functionality of the vault as a cable pulling location. The Junction Boxes will also allow backup of each circuit with a different circuit similar to the functionality of the transfer bus.

Sincerely,

THEKA ASSOCIATES, INC.



Ryan Caauwe
Senior Engineer

cc: Mike Cannady, P.E.